

Evaluating Reasoning

Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4			
			Evaluate the character's decisions:			
What is the action the character takes? (Text based)	What were the consequences? (Text based and/or inferred information)	Why did the character act in this way? (Text based and/or inferred information)	What flaws were there in the character's thinking? Support your answer.	What logical reasons support the choices made? Support your answer.	Do you agree or disagree with the characters reasoning? Support your answer.	Does the character's treatment of the other characters seem fair? Why or why not?
Dr. Nemur and Strauss operate on Charlie Gordon to increase his intelligence	Charlie's intelligence is tripled, but then he returns to an IQ of around 68	He has always wanted to be smart. He believed life would be perfect if he was smart.	<div><div>➤</div>He discovers that people are not the friends he thought they were</div> <div><div>➤</div>He doesn't know if the operation will work</div> <div><div>➤</div>He doesn't know if the operation's result will be permanent</div> <div><div>➤</div>He does not know how this operation will torture him</div>	<div><div>➤</div>Intelligence will open many doors for him</div> <div><div>➤</div>Charlie will "fit in"</div>	Opinion: I agree/disagree... Agree Evidence: <div><div>➤</div>Charlie helps to advance science "disproving a hypothesis is...valuable:</div> <div><div>➤</div>He learns that people are making fun of him</div>	Judgment: Yes, it's fair/ No, it's not fair... Fair Evidence: Throughout the story, Charlie is always trying to be himself

<p><u>Drs. Strauss and Nemur:</u></p> <p>Operated on a mentally handicapped adult to prove that intelligence can be increased</p>	<p>Charlie becomes smart and the doctors gain some degree of fame</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ They were looking to help humanity➤ They hoped to become famous	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ They did not fully think through the ethics of the situation➤ They hurt Charlie to help themselves	<p>They need to experiment on humans to see if the operation can work</p>	<p>Disagree</p> <p>Evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ His life is torn apart➤ He is lonelier in the end than in the beginning <p><u>Agree</u></p> <p>Evidence:</p> <p>Charlie did get smart; he enjoyed the feeling. He said</p>	<p><u>Not fair</u></p> <p>Evidence:</p> <p>The doctors were more</p>
---	---	--	---	---	--	--

					<i>he liked being smart</i> <u>Disagree</u> Evidence: <i>They crushed Charlie</i>	<i>interested in fame than in genuinely helping Charlie</i> <u>Fair:</u> Evidence: <i>They did make Charlie smart</i>
Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4 Evaluate the character's decisions:			
<i>What is the action the character takes?</i> (Text based)	<i>What were the consequences?</i> (Text based and/or inferred information)	<i>Why did the character act in this way?</i> (Text based and/or inferred information)	<i>What flaws were there in the character's thinking?</i> Support your answer.	<i>What logical reasons support the choices made?</i> Support your answer.	<i>Do you agree or disagree with the characters reasoning?</i> Support your answer.	<i>Does the character's treatment of the other characters seem fair?</i> Why or why not?
					<i>More Evidence:</i>	<i>More Evidence:</i>

--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Step 5: What is the most important conclusion that can be drawn from the selection?

Think about how your choices will affect you and others
It is important to value people’s lives over personal gain

Step 6: What would you do in a similar situation? Why?

As the doctor I would not operate on a human until I was sure it would work. As Charlie, I’m not sure, but I don not think I would subject myself to that kind of physical or mental pain.